



BOARD OF REGISTRATION AND ELECTIONS APPROVED MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING – MARCH 16, 2023

The Fulton County Board of Registration and Elections met in Regular Session on Thursday, March 16, 2023, at 10:00 a.m.

**Please join the meeting from your computer, tablet, or smartphone.
FGTV YouTube Channel**

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCYH7E0jH6HxE-3KTRluH8SQ>

Presiding: Cathy Woolard, Chairwoman

Other Board Members Present:

Mrs. Teresa Crawford, Vice Chairperson

Dr. Kathleen Ruth

Mr. Aaron Johnson

Mr. Mark Wingate (virtual)

Staff Attending: Mrs. Nadine E. Williams, Director; Mr. Patrick Eskridge, Deputy Director; Ms. Shamira Marshall, Registration Chief; Mrs. Sharon Benjamin, Deputy Election Chief; Ms. Mariska Bodison, Absentee Manager; Mrs. Janice Dickenson, Administrative Manager; Mrs. Janell Barganier, Financial Systems Manager; Mrs. Jodi Brittan, Absentee Supervisor; Mr. Thomas Johnson, Registration Supervisor; Ms. LaShandra Little, VEO Manager; Mr. James Reese, Production Manager; Ms. Regina Waller, Communications Division Manager; Chad Alexis, Senior Assistant County Counsel; Mrs. Patrise Perkins-Hooker, Legal Counsel

Guests Attending:

#1– APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to adjust the agenda to move Voter Challenges under New Business to item # 4 and move the Monthly Operation Report to item # 6. The motion was made by Dr. Ruth, seconded by Vice Chair Crawford, and carried by a vote of 5-0.

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to approve the agenda as amended. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford, seconded by Dr. Ruth, and carried by a vote of 5-0.

#2– COMMUNICATIONS AND PUBLIC RESPONSE

Lucia Frazier

There's a lot of people here for a challenge today that really didn't have to come here this process was created by legislation to help clean voter rolls and is actually a good process because it gives the County Free labor. By law counties are required to maintain their voter rules obviously this was not happening based on the thousands of voter registrations that have been identified by citizens and substantiated by the board of registration staff obviously there's no person or system that is doing this maintenance obviously the ERIC system isn't catching even a small fraction of what citizens have found

what's not so obvious is why is there pushback and resentment towards cleaning the voter rolls? This is a bipartisan benefit it sure feels and looks like the county is against clean voter rolls when the challenge letters are sent with language that makes the error the citizens fault instead of the county fault or SOS fault whoever typed in the Registration info is at fault whoever didn't decide to utilize readily available tools such as the post office database the driver's license database to check the accuracy of the entry is at fault. Instead of thanking the citizens who volunteer to identify issues and save taxpayer money the county is needlessly upsetting people and wasting their time with negative language on the letters and telling them they have to take time out of their day to come here for a simple correction when all you had to do was make the correction because you already have access to more voter data than any citizen does even worse you didn't even put on the letter that they can just cure the issue by going online and typing the correction.

J. Frazier

All right so today I need to address what's really going on I'd love to speak on some other things but clearly there are a lot of people in the room that I believe are misguided first thing is I did not intend to challenge anyone here today I located errors in the voter rolls I submitted those errors I asked Fulton County elections can you please fix these errors I was given zero response and then I followed up if you will not fix these errors then yes please consider them a voter challenge. Unfortunately, voter challenges are the only way I can get Fulton County to step up to the plate and clean up the voter rolls there are thousands of errors in the voter rolls tens of thousands of duplicate registrations we both know duplicate registrations lead to double voting as I have shown you in the past yes I showed you duplicate registrations that led to double voting don't give me that look okay I am very frustrated here I am appalled that you mailed all these people challenge letters this is embarrassing these are easy fixes in the system as my wife just described you could have gone in the system you could have looked at these errors and cleaned them up we know these duplicate these bad registrations lead to precincts card not being mailed to the right place. If it is a long road and you've got Northwest on one side Southwest on the other people are voting in the wrong precincts they're not getting the voter cards they might have absentee ballots lost these cause real problems to real people not to mention whatever I have identified twenty thousand duplicate registrations these cost hundreds of thousands of dollars in wasted tax dollars to our citizens hundreds of thousands every year we have one ballot marking device for every 250 people on the rolls when you're talking numbers this large this is a tremendous amount of wasted tax dollars to our community we got to do something better guys this is embarrassing whenever somebody finds a simple address update please listen and fix these do not harass the public and do not harass me.

Kelvin Muldowney

Our right to vote is a right to vote is basic and protection of that right is essential this body is the steward of that right clean voter rolls will not only be a tremendous cost savings for the county but it will afford bipartisan voter protection as well thousands of inaccurate voter records inaccurate enough to cause an absentee ballot to never arrive as well as pointing out a simple fix have been brought to the attention of the Registration Department as is evident by what Jason just said and what was their response nothing and now you choose to follow the letter of the law and send out letters naming the Challenger and those affected yes this would have been the correct procedure in a more involved challenge such as where a voter had moved but these were pointed out as clerical errors found through the actual Fulton County data these could have been easily and legally fixed said absentee ballot would have arrived safely in this case the decision was made to weaponize the law and harass citizen that was trying to help in direct contrast to a case where a large number of non-existent Voters addressed to an empty lot were deliberately and illegally left on the voter rolls by the BRE this was after the challenge letter procedure was followed by the way the post office sent all those letters back as address unknown. We desperately need to clean up our voter rolls harassing a citizen is legal as trying to help as a waste of County resources the cry of voter suppression is actually born out of a desperate need for voter protection let's actually protect the vote this is a bipartisan obligation.

Christine Propst

OCGA 21-2-228a Fulton elections has a legal responsibility to maintain our voter rolls yet month after month volunteer citizens as you've heard come here to provide evidence that this is not happening here are just some a summary of what I've reviewed over the last year thousands if not tens of thousands of Voters who have moved and are registered may have voted or owned property in another state are still able to vote in Georgia 20,000 duplicate registrations with more every month six thousand registrations with an invalid or fake address or business address 2,000 registrations with no address 500 plus voters with a missing date of birth hundreds of dead voters who are still active on our rolls and dozens of registrations with missing names how does someone how is someone allowed to register without a name without a date of birth without a valid address you know I'd like to know how this happens and to me and as I mentioned thousands of new errors and duplicates every month so to me this points to some underlying issues the registration review process is clearly broken so validating those registrations is not happening effectively 30 seconds the dashboard is obviously not catching all these errors and the Eric system is not effective Fulton needs to improve the vetting training and performance tracking of Deputy registrars who may be submitting these invalid registrations and in an absolute minimum Fulton should be using a data entry system that validates key fields right it should flag it if there's a field that is empty or it should validate the registration it should validate that information on Entry so you don't have these issues that flow through the system keeping our voting voter rolls clean is a legal requirement this is not a partisan issue this is not meant to penalize valid legal voters there's easy issues that or errors that can be resolved here thank you

Julie Allen

Election law OCGA 21-2-228a states the board of registrars of each County or municipality shall have the right and shall be charged with a duty of examining from time to time the qualifications of each elector of the county or municipality whose name is entered upon the list of electors and shall not be limited or is stopped by any action previously taken it is the law that Fulton maintained their roles Eric is to help with this but the responsibility Falls squarely on Fulton County elections director Nadine Williams to maintain Fulton County rules and handle all Corrections that arrive on their dashboard or are submitted from the public if the public as many of those who have preceded me have stated if they can find thousands of challenges it is clear that Fulton is not maintaining their roles we must have a registrations process that will check and validate all registrations when added ERIC is not doing the job they were supposed to do so Fulton County needs to step up and clean their roles for all of us we do seek to I think we all seek to protect the right to vote of all this is a bipartisan issue that we need to have accurate voting role so everyone's right is protected duplicate registrations waste taxpayer dollars nothing is more bipartisan than saving money and protecting the right to vote clean roles enable everyone that should be on the rolls to vote without issue right sizing the roles reduces stress on the already overworked election staff again I thank you for the privilege of speaking for you and I ask that you hear the concerns of the public that have taken their time off work to come to protect the right of our democracy here and that's the valued right to vote

Lakendra.Graham

I'm here on behalf of myself my rights was challenged um I've been saying that the same address for either since 2011, the only thing that has changed is the street name it can't change from Confederate to United which made my apartment concentrates change into a treasury Village um whenever Miller comes through either you can say United or you can say Confederate I still receive the mail I just feel like this is a waste of my time and also my kids time my kids are doing homeschool so I feel like it's a waste of my time because I'm here when I have other things to do I have a job I have other like I have other plans besides coming here stay stating my opinion and my right to vote because somebody wanted to challenge it I just feel like everybody should put more into trying to figure out and if something like this should happen then someone should put their mind to it or do their job and find out things like that it's just the minor things that could be changed or could be looked into besides wasting money here and that'll be all thank you

Maria Giadio

It has been recently pointed out to me that Fulton County is larger than the four smallest states in the union combined and if you look at the size of their voters registration boards it would be more than four times your size two so I understand that you have a very large job to do but for the last two years citizens have been helping you to do your job to show you that voter rolls are not being maintained they are not correct tens of thousands of illegal votes have been placed and then you publicly reprimand them and spank them I don't understand why that would be you should welcome the help um I've witnessed the cheating I witnessed the ballot stuffing of the boxes I witnessed the ballot stuffing of the trucks the Dodge vans I saw that happening and that just goes away that it doesn't matter to you I don't understand that so unless you're going to listen to these people who are bringing you facts and figures and have the documentation to prove their statements I don't you need to explain to the rest of us why you're not paying attention to them and why it's taken more than two years

Sara Ketchum

I'm here because my residency was challenged I moved out of state and then I moved back in time for to vote I have documentation to prove that I live here um I just I moved out of state and I moved right back um so I'm I don't know if that's where I'm supposed to say this at but I've heard um you know the mission from some previous folks to clean up the voter rolls but I don't appreciate being collateral damage um and my voter um my voter registration being challenged and the right of my vote being taken as collateral damage in this mission that is going on to clean up the voter rolls I will say though in my letter where it is stating that I'm challenged there were no um you know directions about how I can what I need to bring to this meeting I called this morning and no one answered the phone to help me out with that process so I do um want to state that um for the record but um just I don't appreciate being collateral damage in this Mission um to clean up the voter to clean up the voter rolls but also um if you could provide voters in a challenge with what they need to do to resolve this that will also be helpful as well that's all thank you

Lawrie Demorest

I volunteer on a voter protection hotline and it's usually pretty quiet this time of year but in the last week I've taken two calls from people who received these challenge letters and the first person who called um it stated in the letter that she was improperly registered at a business address we looked her up in my voter page her address was correct um she it's a residential address I looked her up on the tax rolls and the tax rolls show that it zoned as a as a single family residence um and so I told her to send that in to the uh to the address on the letter and that was taken care of if I could look it up that easily and confirm that in fact she did not was not registered in business address and the person who was filing these challenges could have taken the time to do that as well and keep this person from having to go through something that was an illegitimate challenge the other person who called was a 74 year old woman calling for her 97 year old mother who had been challenged who had always voted at that address um we called the number given on the letter and I want to commend the staff here who made it very easy for her and told her just to find a utility bill and send it in I can't imagine the amount of work that the staff here is having to go through with 5 000 plus challenges at a single meeting so I do want to commend the staff and I understand that a lot of these problems stem from legislation that this body has no control over legislation by the state thank you

Lauren Waits

I'm here today because I knew that the conversation would be so heated and I want to thank each of the Board of Elections members I want to thank the staff and I want to thank our citizens for participating in the process I'm here to speak up for the process many many many of the issues we're discussing are more appropriately resolved through the Secretary of State's office and the Georgia General Assembly each of us has the right to run for those offices each of us has the right to serve in those offices there are many vacant positions in the Department of Elections I have not decided to take the time to apply for those jobs but I know that I could and unless I were willing to I don't really feel that I'm in a position to believe that I know all the detail uh I'm a fan of big data I understand with a master's in public health the importance of managing 800,000 voter databases and I do know that there will be errors and I know that each of you as well as the staff are working their darndest to resolve those errors so mostly I just want to say thank you I also do want to appreciate some of the colleagues who have gotten up and spoken from an opposite point of view I have served with one in a very friendly way down at the elections Warehouse on paper ballot process another gentleman has protected me in a 5K race which I was grateful and I hope that we will continue to be able to work together collegially and constructively thank you

OLD BUSINESS

#3- APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- Regular Meeting – February 9, 2023

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to approve the Regular Meeting minutes of February 9, 2023. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Mr. Johnson and carried by a unanimous vote of 5-0.

NEW BUSINESS

#5- VOTER'S CHALLENGE HEARING

Chair Woolard announced:

To the folks who are here for corrections, I think everybody's had an opportunity to be able to make any corrections that you want and if they're corrected they can leave if they'd like to and they'll get a letter verifying that. You are welcome to stay and I want to say thank you for coming and thank you for making

the changes but like I said you are welcome to be here we appreciate you being here but I didn't want anyone to feel like you had to sit through the meeting if indeed you don't have to wait.

Ms. Marshall announced:

To the public in the audience that if you already made the correction by filling out a voter registration application we will process that application you are not required to stay for the hearing but you're more than welcome to we will process the application and once we do so we will mail you a Precinct card and also a letter just confirming that you were here today in the correction has been made okay indicate what happens if they didn't have to make a correction some of them just got notices and there were no Corrections needed if you did not have to make a correction we will also mail you a letter of the BRE's decision today just that you came in but there would be no further action taking on your voter registration yes so there are several ways that you can make the address change or updates if you need to we do have paper voter registration applications here today for your use if you would rather do it online you can go to mvp.sos@ga.gov

Director Williams announced:

Again, this is **NOT** a challenge that was sent by Fulton County we did not challenge you. These were persons that submitted challenges to addresses or some other things, when we receive massive challenges we have (10) days to respond. Yes, we will make revisions to the way the letter is written

Mrs. Perkins-Hooker directed Mr. Hubert to raise his right hand:

Mr. David Hubert do you swear/affirm to tell the truth so help you God.

Mr. Hubert responded yes.

- **David Hubert** – Moved Out of State
277 Voters Challenged

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to accept the recommendation of the Chief Registrar of voter's identified as moved out of state. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Dr. Ruth, and carried by a unanimous vote of 5-0.

- **Jason Frazier** – Business Addresses, Invalid Addresses
5,001 Voters Challenged

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to accept the recommendation of the Chief Registrar of voter's identified as registered at business addresses. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Dr. Ruth and carried by a unanimous vote of 5-0.

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to accept the recommendation of the Chief Registrar of voter's identified as registered at invalid addresses. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Dr. Ruth and carried by a unanimous vote of 5-0.

- **Warren Schmitz** – Moved Out of State
255 Voters Challenged

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to deny the challenges by Warren Schmitz. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Mr. Johnson and carried by a unanimous vote of 5-0.

#4– MONTHLY OPERATIONS REPORT FOR DECEMBER 2022

Mrs. Williams greeted the Board and called on **Mr. Eskridge** to discuss the status of the Audit being conducted follow by the Division Leadership to provide their report to the Board.

Mr. Eskridge reported on the Audit being conducted on the Department:

- 2021 the DRE underwent an audit, and this is the follow-up to that Audit
- The DRE engaged in meetings with the County Auditor
- County Auditor provided a list items of to review
- Audit will conduct a financial review to compare and contrast with the original audit
- Personnel is currently collecting that data for timely submission
- 2021 Audit Findings and Responses:
<https://fultoncountyga.gov/-/media/Departments/Office-of-the-County-Auditor/Audit-Reports-and-Management-Responses/2021-Audit-Reports/Registration-and-Elections--Financial-Review-Memo.ashx>

Ms. Bodison reported for the Absentee Division:

- Weekly Meetings with Mrs. J. Brittan, Absentee Supervisor
- Bi-weekly Meetings with the Division’s personnel
 - Completed Evaluations of personnel
 - GARViS Roundtables
- Discussions with various vendors:
 - Quadiant, Runbeck, OPEX, HBSolutions, Enhanced Voting and Fort Orange
- Assisted Voter Registration Division with operational dashboard
- Attended **Georgia Leads Conference in Athens (UGA Campus) January 4-6, 2023**
 - GARViS Training- New Voter Registration Database
 - Introduction to Pollpad Update/ Training
 - E-Pulse Training

Earliest Day to apply for Absentee by Mail for the Municipal General Elections	August 21, 2023
DEADLINE FOR VOTER REGISTRATION/CHANGE OF ADDRESS FOR NOVEMBER 7th GENERAL/SPECIAL ELECTION AND RUNOFF The last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the general/special election and runoff shall be at the close of business on the fifth Monday prior to the date of the election. O.C.G.A. §§ 21-2-224; 21-2-501	October 16, 2023
FIRST DAY TO MAIL ABSENTEE BALLOTS FOR NOVEMBER 7th GENERAL/SPECIAL ELECTION The board of registrars shall mail or issue official absentee ballots 22 days prior to any Municipal General Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384(a)	October 16, 2023
ADVANCED IN PERSON (EARLY) VOTING BEGINS FOR THE NOVEMBER 7th GENERAL ELECTION O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)	October 16, 2023

On-going:

- Indexing of all scanned documents (electronically storing 2022 Absentee Records)

Vice Chair Crawford asked how were the evaluations conducted and how often are they completed?

Ms. Bodison responded in manual form with the Absentee Supervisor, Jodi Brittan, and meetings are scheduled with personnel next week. The Division should plan to evaluate personnel at least every six months but it is difficult during even year elections.

Chair Woolard announced her attendance at the upcoming conference as well as many leadership personnel for the Georgia Association of Voter Registration and Elections Officials (**GAVREO**) Conference in Jekyll Island, GA.

Chair Woolard asked when GARViS would be implemented

Ms. Bodison responded on February 6th was the launch date, but they continue to make improvements to be fully operational.

Chair Woolard

We're anxiously awaiting the implementation of this system because we think it will help us with a number of things that that we've struggled with recently. GARViS was supposed to be implemented last year about this time but redistricting caused the Secretary of State's office to delay until June 2022 and at some point, they decided to delay implementation until this year. I think that was probably a good decision so that everybody could have the time and the attention to do it properly

Mrs. Dickenson reported for the Administration Division:

- **Positions Vacant:**
 - Executive Assistant, Registration Manager, (2) Administrative Coordinator I, VEO Coordinator Lead, (6) Registration Officer, and Absentee Officer
 - Finalize separation of time-limited and seasonal employees.
 - Provided documents for unemployment claims filed.
 - Prepared information to re-establish purchase orders to process invoices for 2022 services / goods.
 - Prepared information to re-establish funding to process invoices for polling stations rentals from previous elections.
 - **Campaign Contribution Disclosure Report:** submitted late and non-filers to the State Finance Commission.
- Next Report Submission:**
- Due Date: January 31, 2023
 - Deadline Date: February 7, 2023

Mrs. Benjamin reported for Advance Voting- Election Division:

GARVIS

- In-person GARVIS intensive training session that the SOS team conducted
- Can potentially provide efficiencies in the early voting process by automating certain tasks
 - reducing certain mistakes due to human error.
- February 6th GARVIS launched, and we began reviewing and identifying those immediate changes necessary to fully implement the GARVIS system for the 2023 municipal elections
- Upcoming: intensive instructor training; developing a revised training curriculum including back-up systems and procedures if GARVIS and Poll Pad suffer systemic failures; and, build-out of relevant classroom materials, and manuals.

In the last election cycle, our incredible early voting staff manually processed more than 473,000 voters in the general and run-off elections without a major system failure, and at a negligible error rate. While it is expected that GARVIS will further reduce this error rate, implementing GARVIS is not anticipated to result in a reduction of staffing requirements for early voting locations.

The Carter Center's report observed that during early voting, approximately 32 voters were processed per hour, compared to 36 voters processed per hour on election day. Please note that during early voting, voters were processed manually while on election day, voter processing was fully automated. AV staff and voters are going to see the efficiency with the automated enhancement.

MOCK ELECTION

We would like to conduct a mock election to allow Fulton County residents and staff an opportunity to use the new voting equipment prior to the upcoming election. This mock election will further allow us to gauge the quality and effectiveness of our training and the reliability of our processes and their implementation.

LESSONS LEARNED ROUND TABLE

We conducted a zoom post-election round table discussion titled "Lessons Learned" on 2/6/23 with approximately 36 EV managers of the 2022 general and runoff elections. The two-hour feedback session was designed to thank them for their extraordinary effort and hard work and provide our EV managers the opportunity to speak with the management team and elicit their observations, ideas, and suggestions on how to improve early voting training and operations. We consider this feedback to be critical to our continuous improvement efforts and take every opportunity to evaluate and implement those ideas which will ultimately help to improve the early voting experience. Participants in the roundtable freely and enthusiastically offered their opinions on a broad range of subjects and provided some very useful insights regarding the introduction of a part-time schedule pilot program, including their support for the retention of continuous full-time shifts for duration of the election cycle. The information garnered from this session will be further studied and evaluated by the EV management team.

Vice Chair Crawford inquired about the proposed part-time scheduling of **EV** workers and concerns with recruitment

Mrs. Benjamin responded the plan is to aggressively recruit and to triple the reserves.

Mr. A. Johnson inquired about the Mock Election and planning of the event

Mrs. Benjamin explained that it will be at multiple locations, advertised and open to the public; similar to how the **DRE** conducted Mock Elections in previous years.

Mr. A. Johnson directed **Mrs. Benjamin** to ensure the **BRE** is updated on the pending event to assist with spreading the word

Mrs. Benjamin responded the **BRE** will be notified

Mr. A. Johnson asked **Mrs. Benjamin** to provide the "Lesson Learned" to the **BRE**

Mrs. Benjamin responded that the **BRE** will receive a copy of the document (subjects and resolution)

Chair Woolard asked about the Mock Election or will this be beta testing of the equipment

Mrs. Benjamin explained that the desire is to have a Mock Election due to certain changes as it relates to the new/upgraded system. I want the voters and the staff to actually see the results

Mrs. Williams reported for Election Day- Election Division:

- The amended the Municipal Cost Resolution by the BOC to match 2021 actual budget expenses with a 10% increase.
- We are currently revising the percentage total cost due from each municipality and are attempting to decrease expenditures to stay within the revised budget total.
- Legal is currently revising the Intergovernmental Agreements (IGA) which will be forwarded to the cities by February 24th.
- Cities will be given a deadline of March 31st to advise if municipal services are needed from Fulton County

Election Date:	Municipal Election November 7, 2023
Runoff Date:	Municipal Runoff Election December 5, 2023
Municipalities in Upcoming Election:	TBD
Municipalities Not Included:	Milton – to conduct their own election Palmetto – to conduct their own election Sandy Springs – no election scheduled
Proposed Precinct Location Changes:	29 to date; to be presented at the March BRE Meeting

Vice Chair Crawford asked about Municipalities that are conducting their own elections, are they required by law to use the same precincts or can they change locations

Director Williams responded that they are permitted to change but the Municipalities need to speak with their assigned SOS Liaison with regards to their plans to change Precinct locations

Mr. A. Johnson mentioned seeing some of the **BOC** meeting regarding the Municipal Resolution that was approved and how that affects the **DRE**

Director Williams explained that the **BOC** approved the Resolution and added that the Budget be based on the 2021 Actuals expenses with a 10% increase. That reduced the projected budget by over \$1 Million.

Collectively, we have reduced services, staff, and start dates of staff to get to that budget dollar amount.

Mr. A. Johnson asked do think you that decision will affect the department ability to handle the elections for 2023

Director Williams responded that this will definitely increase the workload for permanent staff as well supplemental staff but as a group we're committed to this process and we're going to make it work.

Mr. A. Johnson asked will the reduction include less Early Voting locations because one of my bigger concerns the **DRE** making voting as accessible as possible, but it cost more for every **EV** location. **Mr. A. Johnson** asked what happens if we go over budget

Director Williams explained that if the County pays the balance, it would be in violation of Election code {O.C.G.A. 21-2-45(c)}. **Director Williams** responded yes, we are reducing EV locations,

but we are mapping the locations out and evenly distributing to ensure that there are no voter suppression complaints

Mr. Wingate asked was the 2023 Municipal budget laid out clearly

Director Williams responded that there will be a meeting to finalize the revised cost and an Itemized summary will be distributed to the at that point

Mr. Wingate asked have the **DRE** had the opportunity to look into what the potential cost and ramifications are going to be or could be in terms of shift work

Director Williams explained the **DRE** is still reviewing all possible cost implications, but the cost should offset because it's not multiple shifts in one day

Mr. Wingate inquired about the amount of temporary staff is needed to fulfill those roles

Director Williams explained the **DRE** will still conduct Recruitment Fairs to recruit citizens that want to participate

Chair Woolard:

I've got a few comments and things to say about this I just want to kind of set the stage of where we are and how we got to this piece about Municipal elections because we've been talking about this now for two of our meetings and probably since Christmas for the staff as soon as they finished with the runoff they turned their sights to this so I'm going to make some statements for the purposes of educating people who are here and watching and I would really appreciate it if anybody would correct me if I say something that is not accurate because I'll make sure I'm accurate in my own thinking about this right so a couple things to set the record straight by Georgia state law Fulton County taxpayers are not permitted to pay for Municipal elections that includes City elections School Board elections special elections other things that's the budget responsibility of those entities that are participating in those elections some counties like Gwinnett and I'm fact checking do not do these elections at all some counties do like one or two in the past I think we've done most of them my understanding is that Palmetto does there's a lot in Mountain Park so this is an optional service that we are permitted to do as long as we don't use County budget to cover the cost of providing that service prior to 2019 the way municipalities and those other entities were billed was based on their percentage of the number of Voters in the county in 2019 the Board of Commissioners made a policy changed to require that we charged municipalities \$2.96 per voter. As a result of that in 2021 Fulton County taxpayers had to pay for about two million dollars in expenses that were not covered by that \$2.96 Resolution that the Board of Commissioners made when we noticed and thank you very much to our Interim Director hopefully will be permanent Director brought to us that we needed to update that so we would not be out of compliance with the law she suggested in keeping with the format established by the Board of Commissioners that we go to a price that reflects the per voter price that's difficult to estimate because there have been massive changes in the expenses of Elections as a result of Senate Bill 202 runoff elections that we can't anticipate other things that are determined by the general assembly and general and not by us so that cost now is up to around ten dollars a voter I'm just being very random about the number but it's somewhere around that that discussion took place here we approved moving that forward to the Board of Commissioners they did not like that price nor did the municipalities we don't blame them we don't set it we're just trying to make sure we get it right for our part which is that we don't have Fulton County taxpayers paying for elections for which they are not responsible our team went back to work and came up with the pre-2019 process that worked very well for I don't know how many years but apparently a lot to just allocate by percentage so any cities that want us to conduct an election we added up divided by the percentages of those people voting of those people on the roles in those cities and divided amongst the municipalities working of course with the municipalities to try to be as cost effective as we possibly can took that to this board we approved that approach went to the Board of Commissioners last week they did not like that approach and suggested that they passed a resolution that they would they want us to go to the 2021 cost plus some 10% overage to give you know some room we have massive inflation we have continued costs that are coming up equipment that we are required to buy blah blah blah so far have everything I said been factual and correct I really want to be corrected because I want to make sure I'm not misunderstanding the situation sounds like that's true so what we have before us is that this board has made two different recommendations to keep us in compliance with state law now we have a third recommendation passed by the Board of Commissioners which stands because they control the budget giving us a dollar amount that that we can try to meet Ms. Williams has suggested that we're about a million dollars out of Plum and again there's lots and lots of variables to this at this stage of the game and including we don't know how many we're going to conduct where we're going to conduct them what our options are for doing that I am deeply concerned about this I'm always deeply concerned when people establish policies kind of on a whim right where it's just a better number a number we like better is one that's not based on the analysis that not only this team but the County's finance department and others have put now two months of work into I think it begs a conversation ultimately with us between now and when we get sort of a final resolution from our staff about whether we want to conduct Municipal elections at all if we get to a point where we're being asked to conduct elections out of compliance with Georgia law I would submit that we need to get out of the business I'm just stating that as a fact so that nobody is surprised that when I engage this discussion further once we get those numbers back from the staff once they've checked with the SOS on the kinds of things we can eliminate and what we can't eliminate once we look at all of the requirements that come to us but what I will strongly advocate for is that we stop breaking the law based on policies that require us to do so I will stop now because I think I've made myself incredibly clear on this process I just want to thank our team here in the Fulton County finance department and others who have done multiple models over the last two months literally running from the runoff straight into this Buzz saw for the last two months to try to come up with something that is fair and accurate it is not our fault that Fulton County elections cost what they do and I'll continue to have some conversations about that

as we go into the future but I do want to put it on the table that in 2021 we were out of compliance and Fulton County taxpayers paid I think \$2 million plus more than they were authorized to do so by Georgia law and I hope somebody does something about it before I do.

Mr. A. Johnson mentioned that Clayton County do not conduct Municipal elections, they offer but most of the Cities down there opt to conduct their own. Ironically, one thing I found out is they still use paper to cast their vote and they literally count paper ballots. My question just for clarity, the rules are slightly different for municipalities that conduct their own elections

Director Williams responded yes, and they would consult their SOS Liaison of their options

Mr. A. Johnson expounded on how the **DRE** is governed and the differences in cost:

it seems to be to me is they're comparing prices for a paper election against the prices for a machine-led election so for example our elections Fulton County is required to use the machines that print out the paper that didn't have the scanner so you have to have technicians available you have to have printers available you have to have the scanner available and you have to have that paper that you can't get from Staples right yes so that's an additional cost that cities don't have to incur if they were to do their own elections so our elections would naturally be higher just based on that alone not to mention the training that has to go in because I'm going to guess because I try to be smart sometimes but the training for using those machines would probably be a little more intense than training for using a piece of paper. so when we say when we hear cities complaining about how much it costs for the county to run elections for them has anybody has there ever been a point where the city is acknowledged that they don't have to follow the same rules as Fulton County and if they wanted like for instance for us it may cost \$9.00 I'm just making up a number and don't I'm not trying to tie you to a number but it may cause nine dollars per voter based on what we have to do where for them with just a sheet of paper and a printer it can cost \$1.50 per person so naturally it would be obviously it would be cheaper for them to conduct it on conduct their elections on their own t

Director Williams explained the **DRE's** intention was never to say we would not do Municipal elections when we sent out the information it was just making the cities aware if they're concerned about cost they have options; they could conduct their own election for cost savings

Vice Chair Crawford echoed Madam Chair's comments.

Mr. Wingate asked about municipalities moving towards conducting their own elections there isn't anything that prevents them from conducting all elections going into the into the future

Director Williams explained no they cannot conduct the county-wide or Statewide election they can only do their municipal election

Mrs. Barginier reported for Finance- Administration Division:

- 2023 Elections budget
- Temp agency bids have been received from Purchasing for 2023 supplemental staff

2022 Financial Results:		
Operations Budget	Budget \$4,391,024	Actual \$4,618,115
Elections Approved Total Budget	Budget \$33,026,729	Actual \$20,896,054
General Primary	Budget \$10,475,096	Actual \$6,529,584
General Primary Run-off	Budget \$9,852,568	Actual \$2,709,816
General Election	Budget \$12,403,864	Actual \$8,968,460
General Election Run-off	Actual \$2,688,194 (Funded by underruns)	
2022 TOTAL Actual Costs:	\$25,514,168	
2023 Proposed Budget:		
Operations Budget	\$4.6 Million	
Elections Proposed Budget	\$9.5 Million	

In the BOC meeting on 2/01/23, the BOC requested a reduction to the 2023 Municipal Elections budget to the total 2021 Actual elections costs plus a 10% increase for 2023. We are working to revise the 2023 Elections budget to reduce it to the required change which is a total of \$8.1M.

For 2022 expenses, we have received BOC approval to rollover from 2022 funding to cover the costs of 2022 vendor invoices not received in DEC 2022 in the amount of \$2.6 million. We are working to process the 2022 vendor invoices now that the BOC has approved the rollover of funds into 2023.

Madam Chair commended the **DRE** for their efforts in managing the 2022 Budget.

Mr. Olomo reported for Information System-Election Division:

- **GARViS** – Attended conference and training for the new voter registration system. The new System will interact with the Poll Pad management console (Epulse). This process will require our poll pads to have an internet connection during Early voting and some optional but essential add-on accessories for the poll pads. We have reached out to the vendor for pricing.
- Held a meeting with other division managers and supervisors to discuss each division's responsibilities and how the new System may affect their current workflow.

- **Election Infrastructure Information Sharing and Analysis Center (EI-ISAC)** – Attended a new member webinar and met with the regional account manager to discuss a no-cost customized cybersecurity recommendation for our department.
 - IP/Domain
 - MDBR - Malicious Domain Blocking and Reporting
 - EDR - Endpoint Detection and Response
- **Audit** – Systems Specialist worked on providing a detailed inventory report for all add-on equipment:

Total number ICX/BMD – **3,560**
Total number ICP Scanner – **411**
Total number Poll Pad – **1,271**
ADD-ON Equipment
Total number Laptop – **341**
Total number Hotspot – **118**
Total number Cradle Point – **288**
Total number Mobile Phone – **300**

Vice Chair Crawford asked about the upgrade to Poll pads during Early voting they're coming up with a printer like a cash register receipt, that would take away everybody having to sign the affidavit correct. Are we going to have to buy that printer?

Mr. Olomo explained the device is optional so we can decide to buy the printer, or we can decide to run reports from ePulse or GARViS

Mr. Wingate asked those entities who has access right so I mean who can do any manipulation who Could You Know download it download another file uh change something you know I I'm just curious as to you know where and whom that access and Authority lies

Director Williams responded we're confident that the system will be secure but again when we receive all those guidelines we'll provide a copy of that to the board

Mr. Wingate expressed concerns on the Poll Pads update and individuals that will have access to download or change anything

Chair Woolard directed Director Williams to provide an update at the next meeting.

Director Williams responded yes when we receive all the details from the Secretary of State's Office which will apply to this County as well all counties in the state of Georgia because the same exact rules apply to every County. The **DRE** will advise the Board but again we do not have control of that system it's not our system it's for the entire state of Georgia controlled by the SOS and the manufacturer

Ms. Marshall reported for Voter Registration Division:

- Processed voter registration applications
 - Processed registration issues
- Prepared notices to voter registration applicants
- Researched street issues
- Preparation for Municipal Street Audits
- Redistricting
- Merging Duplicate Records
- Attended various GARViS Training (Launched February 6, 2023)
- Registered Voters **862,184** – total
 - **758,425** - active
 - **103,759** - inactive
 - **10,362** applications
 - **4,318** new registrations
 - **3,357** transfers to Fulton County
 - **1,520** removals from Fulton County ***1,508 Duplicate Records**
 - Temporary Voter Identification Card (TVIC) **112**

Ms. Marshall noted everything is going well with the implementation of the new system, we are excited about the changes that GARViS will help within our division:

- Duplicates process- SOS stated that they were only using one category in ENet and in GARViS it's using (5) categories
- Business addresses
- Felons
- Vital Records

We've tested the system and we see the duplicates go up and we have also taken a look at the duplicates and actually merged them so GARViS is actually working

Mr. Wingate asked about the Transfer out of county

Ms. Marshall responded that it was not included but plans to include those statistics in all future reports

Director Williams reported on Supply and Logistics-Election Division:

- Corresponded via emailed with all polling locations for the 2023 Election calendar
 - November 7th, 2023 Municipal Election and December 6th Runoff date.
- We are receiving reservation form confirmations, and no confirmations via emails, which will require precinct location change.
- Organizing and developing the move outline for the Department to the new Election Central location

SUPPLY & INVENTORY STATISTICS	
Private Polling Site Confirmation	30 confirmation received, 3 precinct location changes requested, and 111 still pending.
Fulton County Schools Polling Sites	48 Pending

City of Atlanta Parks and Recreation	23 Pending
City of Atlanta Public Schools	28 Pending
South Fulton Parks and Recreation	5 Pending

Ms. Little reported on Voter Education and Outreach Division- Administration Division:

- Contacted schools, communities, non-profit organizations, government officials, and all c to schedule future events across the county.
- all municipalities to schedule events before the Voter Registration deadline, focusing on planned citywide events and working with Park and Recreation staff.
- VEO manager participates in legislative meetings as needed to discuss all bills introduced that impact the elections department
- VEO manager participated in Election Officials day at the state capitol to discuss the new voter registration and information system and the new poll pads program to be implemented for advanced voting with the county legislators.
- VEO manager is scheduled a meeting with the new County commissioners to provide an overview of the VEO program.
- Planned monthly Deputy Register training, certifications must be renewed yearly
 - 0 deputy registrars trained
 - 0 absentee applications
 - 10 voters registered
 - 150 connection
 - 0 poll workers recruitments
 - 175 event interactions
 - 2 voter id cards
 - 2 media inquiries

PAST AND UPCOMING EVENTS		
1/25/2023	VEO	Rosel Fann Recreation Center 365 Cleveland Ave, SE , Atlanta, GA 30354
1/26/2023	VEO	Nurse Care of Buckhead 2920 Pharr Court South NW Atlanta GA 30305
2/9/2023	FMBO	Atlanta Technical College, 1560 Metropolitan Pkwy, SW, Atlanta, GA 30310
2/11/2023	FMBO	Renaissance Community Church, 3675 Butner Road, Atlanta, Georgia 30349
2/22/2022	FMBO	Wheat Street Towers 375 Auburn Ave. NE Atlanta, Ga. 30312
2/24/2023	FMBO	Alpharetta International Academy, 4773 Webb Bridge Rd Alpharetta, GA 30004

VEO (Voter Education and Outreach)

FMBO (Fulton Mobile Bus Outreach)

Mr. Wingate asked what activities you are doing during the Fulton Mobile Bus outreach events

Ms. Little explained:

- Voter Qualification
- Youth Voter Education Preparation Programs
- How to Register
- Education for young voters (18 – 29)
- Change of Residence
- Outreach services and assistance for Senior Citizens
- Sample Ballots
- Glossary of Common Voter Registration and Elections Terms
- Election Dates and Deadlines
- Schedule of Voter Education Demonstration
- Information and Assistance Contacts
- Election Day Trouble Shooting
- Local and National Statistics
- Election Results Display
- Polling Locations
- Most Common Questions and Answers
- Poll Worker Information
- Voter Education and Outreach Community Calendar
- Absentee (by mail and in person) and Early Voting
- Legislative Updates
- New Citizenship
- Voting Laws and Regulations
- Changes in Election and Voter Registration Laws
- Voter Photo ID

Mr. Wingate asked about expenditures for 2022

Ms. Little responded that the information was not readily available

Mr. Wingate mentioned receiving VEO's budget and it was \$427K but the dollar amount did not outline how the money was allocated

Mr. Wingate:

It's just my curiosity in terms of the budget and trying to make sure that we're expending the taxpayer's money wisely is that a logical amount of money to spend on these activities particularly this year since we're only dealing with the Municipal elections and it's in that October November time frame foregoing any runoff, but we don't have that much election activity that we have had in the past few years I think we all agree to that. I'm just curious if there is a way the **DRE** can clearly and very easily define why we're expending these funds

Director Williams responded that our voter education program is critical to our department their efforts in going out into the community to educate our voters it stops calls later regarding confusion in voter increasing locations it helps in recruitment for election day and advance voting so without their efforts it would be a shortfall in other areas in our department in our processes so that's why that money is money well spent honestly

Mr. A. Johnson:

I was just going to say that again this is evident of being a victim of your own success as we had to repurpose after the changes that were made for the Department, I know that you're consistently being asked to go from here to there and I think y'all are doing a fantastic job. I've gone to events held by Commissioners held by cities and I see the buses there and I see the lines I see the people learning how to use the machines kids getting information to help develop them to become voting citizens in their communities getting people to understand. I sometimes you don't realize how much you know being around this Arena about what's going on and how much people don't know how much your neighbors don't know how many people in senior center don't understand what's going on and while we may only have a municipal election this year you're still training people for the process how to vote you're training people to understand that when they go they may be in a new District which this year is a perfect year to spend time on that so that next year you don't have like the director is saying you don't have to answer those questions all over again you still might because you know we forget but I think that your department is doing an exceptional job in educating as many people around Fulton County and Fulton County I think is unique also in the diversity of the county we have so many people whereas a county that I'm originally from only has 40 000 people my community has 40 000 people and we have 16 community in Fulton County so I don't disagree with Mr. Wingate wanting to see a breakdown of what the budget is but I do want everybody who's watching/listening to understand that this Division does a great job of going around the county trying to enlighten as many people as possible

Vice Chair Crawford asked will other Divisions complete personnel evaluations

Mr. Eskridge responded that yes, we met last week we're going to be doing that department-wide we're preparing a template that we're going to use that it's applicable on a Universal level and that will be a bi-annual practice that we implement this year moving forward

NEW BUSINESS

#5-DISCUSSION OF VOTERS IN PENDING STATUS- 26 MONTH CLOCK

Ms. Marshall expounded:

Detailed report to provide a breakdown of the pending applicants due to the 26-month clock list maintenance process. **See** O.C.G.A. § 21-2-220 (d). If an applicant fails to provide all the required information on the application for voter registration, the board of registrars shall notify the registrant in writing of the missing information.

Status Breakdown	Number of Voters	Registrar Recommendations
Pending Citizenship Verification	465	All applicants whose name appears on the "26-month clock" list be grandfathered in. I recommend that we enter these applications into GARViS and

		allow the applicants until the date of expiry (determined by ENet) to respond.
Year of Expiry 2023	37	
Year of Expiry 2024	287	
Year of Expiry 2025	141	

26 Month Clock Voters – During the 2017 legislative session, the Georgia General Assembly passed House Bill 268, which made changes to the verification process. HB 268 extended the time for applicants to provide supporting documentation to 26 months before the application is rejected. The applicant will be placed on the 26-month clock after the system generated letter has been printed from the batch print queue on the Dashboard. If the record is not updated before the 26-month clock expires, the applicant will automatically be moved into Rejected status with the status reason of Not Verified. A rejection letter will be generated.

Changes: The Secretary of State’s Office mentioned in GARViS Training that the law is changing this timeframe to **45 days**. We will work with the SOS and provide any written language.

Next Step: All applicants will be notified of the BRE’s decision and of their date of expiry. Their status will not be Rejected within 45 days.

Chair Woolard mentioned tracking legislation but I haven’t heard anything about this

Ms. Marshall noted it was mentioned in one of her GARViS trainings

Director Williams mentioned that no action is required by the **BRE** today, this item was informational

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chairperson Woolard entertained a motion to close the regular session and convene into executive session to discuss legal and personnel matters. The motion was made by Mr. Johnson, seconded by Vice Chair Crawford, and carried by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

After executive session, **Chairperson Woolard entertained a motion to resume into regular session. The motion was made by Mr. Johnson, seconded by Vice Chair Crawford, and carried by a unanimous vote of 4-0.**

Regular Session:

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to approve Nadine Williams’ salary for the Director of Registration and Elections’ position at \$185,000.00. The motion was made by Vice Chair Crawford and was seconded by Mr. Wingate and carried by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

BOC Recess Meeting

February 15, 2023

Executive Session:

23-0140

F. A motion was made by Commissioner Abdur-Rahman and seconded by Commissioner Barrett, to approve the recommendation of the Board of Registration and Elections to appoint Nadine Williams as the Director of Elections with an annual salary of \$185,000.00 effective February 15, 2023. **The motion passed by the following vote:**

Yea: Pitts, Barrett, Hall, Arrington, and Abdur-Rahman

Nay: Thorne, and Ellis

ADJOURNMENT

Chairwoman Woolard entertained a motion to adjourn. Mr. Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice Chair Crawford seconded the motion. Collectively, the Board agreed to adjourn at 11:57 a.m.

The meeting adjourned.

Prepared by
Mariska Bodison, Absentee Manager